Beatriz Rodriguez (bmr2479)

True Story Assignment

1. The story basically highlights the fact that this particular hospital is located in a developing nation and therefore doesn’t have as much financial and social support by its local government. As a result, the hospital is currently working hard to redeem itself and regain the peoples trust. However, during a surgery to remove a woman’s cataracts the wrong serum was applied into the woman’s eye, leaving her blind in one eye with cataracts in the other. The hospital is now struggling to decide on whether to come forward to the woman about their mistake or to just let her believe her spiritual assumption that it was snake venom, since she is into voodoo. The hospital knows that if they come forward with this, they might completely lose credibility once and for all, which is why they’re very hesitant to come forward with the truth.
2. The stakeholders involved are the woman receiving the surgery, the hospital and the local government.
3. The most significant issue at stake is that the hospital can completely lose government funding and support if they tell the woman the truth about her eye, but they also face an ethical issue by lying to her.
4. For the philosophy of utilitarianism, the hospital would be making the right choice by not telling the woman the truth about her eye because it would be for the greater good of society. If the hospital were to shut down over this incident, then the people of this area would not have a hospital nearby to go to in case of an emergency.

For the philosophy of duty-based, the hospital should tell the woman the truth about the serum injected into her eye during the surgery because deviating would just not be okay. Humanitarianism and moral motivation are the priority in this situation, therefore lying to the woman about what happen to her eye would not be moral.

For the philosophy of virtue, the decision that is to be made regarding the incident is a bit more difficult because it depends on the virtues of the stakeholders responsible for the incident. The people of the hospital could establish honesty as their main virtue in this situation and come clean to the woman and face a possible shut down. However, they could also prioritize the greater good of society and let the woman go home blinded, in order to avoid leaving the area without a hospital. Therefore, it truthfully just depends on what the hospital prioritizes the most in the situation.